Assessment of Public and Private Agri-Skills and Agricultural Extension Services Delivery System in selected woredas in Arsi, West Arsi and West Shewa Zones in Oromia region in Ethiopia

SP C &C Regional Platform Meeting
Stakeholders validation workshop on Agr-Skills and Agri-Chemicals Research & Planning for Collaboration
Darartu Hotel, Asela
September 5, 2018

By
Sebsibie Zuber
Managing Director & Senior Consultant
bbs.africa.consult@gmail.com
+251-911-677039

Victor van der Linden
Senior Business Development Advisor
victor.vanderlinden@fs-ethiopia.com
+251-944-114179

Presentation Outline
1. Introduction
2. Objective of the research
3. Approach & Methodology
4. Key findings
5. Conclusions
Introduction

Background
ICCO Cooperation for Ethiopia
Strategic Partnership and Convening and Convincing (SPC&C) Program 2016-2020

ICCO Cooperation for Ethiopia: Strategic Partnership and Convening and Convincing (SPC&C) Program 2016-2020

Create Conditions for Devt

Pathway-1: Creating space for civil society organizations
Pathway-2: Realizing inclusive and sustainable food system
Pathway-3: Small-producers empowerment and access to market
Pathway-4: Moving towards a sustainable private sector

Contribute
Decrease inequality and injustice in societies

CSOs

Four SP C & C Program Pathways

Economic
Social
Political
Introduction…contd

• Pathway -3 : Small-producers empowerment and access to markets
  • To empower smallholder farmers malt barley and potato value chains (Arsi, West Arsi and West Shewa zones)
  • four crucial services to smallholder farmers - previous study
    • access to agri-skills,
    • access to inputs,
    • access to finance and
    • access to markets

Objective of the research

• General Objective
  • To understand the strengths, weaknesses and gaps within the ATVET and Development Agent’s (DA) systems on the provision and delivery of relevant skills training to smallholder farmers in the malt barley and potato value chains, and to investigate how other service providers (non-state actors and private sector) are complementing and providing alternatives to this public system
Objective of the research...contd

Specific objectives

1. Identification of the inclusiveness of access to and outreach of agri-skills, training services, and agricultural extension services in the SPC&C target areas, particularly opportunities for reaching out to women, youth and people with disabilities;

2. Assessment of the quality and relevance of skills and delivery of trainings to DA's at ATVETs in the S PC & C target areas as a crucial component of the public system;

3. Exploring the business case for private sector extension services relevant for potato and malt barley farmers and how the provision of these services is currently done to smallholder farmers (projects, fee-bases services etc.)

Key concepts in the study

Inclusive extension services:

- integration of smallholder farmers into the extension service delivery system.
- Extension is more impactful when the approach considers “the whole family and community approach” instead of focusing only on model farmers and household heads.
- consideration the needs and interest of male, female, youth including disabled farmers, in all farming systems of a given area.
- This component considers the extent to which various types of agri-skills and extension service are accessible to and reach out to excluded subsets of smallholder farmers.
Key concepts in the study

- **Agri-skills**
  - crop production related *technical skills and soft skills*
  - development agents and farmers for improving production and productivity of malt barley and potato

- **Crop production techniques related technical skills**
  - improved agronomic practices on site selection and land preparation,
  - seeds, fertilizer and agro-chemicals application and safe handling, storage, grading, packaging & transportation

---

Key concepts in the study

- **Soft skills**
  - communication and facilitation skills,
  - entrepreneurial skills,
  - participatory approach and rural problem analysis,
  - knowledge of business planning and value chain development and marketing,
  - inclusiveness and diversity,
  - market linkages, financial management, leadership, data collection, analysis and reporting skills
Key concepts in the study

- **Quality and relevance of learning at ATVET/TVET**
  - addresses the Ethiopian policy direction
  - ATVET/TVET system focused on the teaching and learning process and its effectiveness
    - It is a measure of the quality of any (A)TVET program
    - how effectively the program is conducted
    - as well as its relevance in terms of meeting skill needs
  - the extent to which the ATVET/TVET system is responsive to
  - DA labour market needs and requirements, and,
  - by extension, to the needs of the end consumer of these services:
    - the smallholder farmer including the more vulnerable groups mentioned.

Methodology of the assessment

- **Research design and process**
  - several discussions with F&S Ethiopia, Edukans and AgriProFocus program staff
  - document review,
  - refining study methodologies and approaches,
  - developing data collection instruments/tools,
  - producing an inception report,
  - executing the field visit and data collection,
  - analysis and reporting, review of the draft report by the client, **validation workshop**, and
  - submission of the final version of the report
Methodology of the assessment

Overall research design and process

- Pre-Travel
- Field Data Collection
- Analysis & Report Writing (Draft)
- Final and Popular Version of the Report
- Conduct validation workshops

Methodology...contd

- Target and geographic scope

Source: Sona et al, 2017
Methodology...contd

- **Data collection methods**
  - qualitative and quantitative primary data
  - The information and data collected
    - desk review
    - individual interviews,
    - focus group discussions (FGD) and
    - key informant interviews (KII)
    - case studies
    - direct observation of FTCs and other actors

Methodology...contd

- **Actors involved in study**
  - Malt barley producer farmers
  - farmer groups including women, youth and people with disabilities
  - woreda agriculture office
  - woreda women and children affairs
  - subject matter specialists (SMSs)
  - Woreda cooperative promotion office
  - DAs
  - farmer cooperative unions (FCUs)
  - Farm Service Centres (FSCs) & Private input suppliers
  - Improved seed suppliers-OSE & ESE
  - research centers
  - SP C & C Implementing partners: EUCORD, HUNDE, ICCO
  - ATVETs/TVET-deans and instructors
Key findings

1. **KeyFs1**: Overview Ethiopian agricultural extension system
   - Agricultural Development-Led Industrialization (ADLI) strategy-
   - Increasing productivity in smallholder agriculture Gov’t top priority
   - promoted and supported the public extension service as a key instrument to meet the agricultural sector development objectives
     - 30% women and 10% youth participation

2. **KF 2**: Smallholder farmer access to agri-skills and extension services delivery

3. **KF 3**: The Public system: ATVETs & TVETs

4. **KF 4**: The private system: Private and CSO’s in agri-skills and extension services provision
Key findings 1 … contd

• The agricultural extension system is a major element of the agricultural and rural development strategy
• Appropriate technologies need to be disseminated through a strong agricultural research and extension system

Key findings 1 … contd

• Major components of the extension system in Ethiopia
• four major components
  1. Participatory Extension System (PES) a modified version of PADETES ,
  2. Farmer Training Centers (FTCs),
  3. Agricultural Technical and Vocational Education (ATVET) and
  4. Institutional Coordination
Key findings 1…contd

1. **Farmer Training Centers (FTCs)**
   - FTCs established - lowest administrative unit (kebele)
   - a critical resource needed to enable extension delivery focal points for farmers to
     - receive information,
     - training,
     - demonstrations and advice, and include both classrooms and demonstration fields.
   - a node between extension services of the DAs and farmers
   
   FTCs are managed - kebele level
   - funding for capital, operational, and salary – woreda
   - Each FTC-DAs-
     - plant science, animal science, and natural resources management) and one Animal health and
   - one Cooperative DA are shared between 3 to 5 FTCs in the vicinity
Key findings ... contd

- More than a decade - FTC-based agricultural extension system was introduced
- Currently the government established 12,500 FTCs and national target of 18,000 FTCs

Key findings ... contd

- ATVET institutions
- Govt established and operationalized 25 ATVETs in different parts of the country to produce skilled development agents (DAs)
- The DAs are trained in five major areas:
  1. animal science,
  2. plant science,
  3. animal health,
  4. natural resource management and
  5. cooperative promotion
Key findings1 …contd

- Farmers’ training- through ATVET graduates or DAs and FTCs
  - improved access to agricultural inputs and products
  - development and expansion of markets are key support programs that help these initiatives
  - to-date over 83,000 DAs have been trained and graduated, of whom about 56,000 DAs are working in agricultural extension

Key findings1…contd

- The number of DAs and FTCs are very good achievements, but
  - most of the DAs are not skillful and
  - the FTCs are ill-equipped as is indicated in the design (Belay et al., 2010)
Key findings1 ...contd

- Inclusiveness of the agricultural extension system in Ethiopia
- An effective and efficient agricultural extension system
  - play a vital role to enhance the agricultural productivity and production levels of smallholders
  - development of innovative,
  - systematic, and
  - dynamic agriculture extension services
- Inclusiveness, however, is a crucial requirement for the system to be effective

Key findings1 ...contd

- The new agricultural extension strategy of Ethiopia was formulated to address challenges
  - mainstreaming as a key approach to ensure
    - equality between women and men, and
    - through increased agricultural production, productivity,
    - leading to the wellbeing of women and youth farmers
Key findings...contd

- The **four main bottlenecks** that affect gender, youth and nutrition mainstreaming are
  1. Poor gender and youth mainstreaming in extension programs planning, implementation and in monitoring, learning and evaluation;
  2. Shortage of gender disaggregated data;
  3. Socio-cultural constraints; and
  4. Inadequate nutrition sensitive extension service

Key findings...contd

- This strategy has developed seven systemic interventions to address these issues.
- The new strategy therefore aimed to reform the sector by **empowering the farmers through**
  - Quality extension service delivery
Key findings 1 ...contd

- Key proposed strategic interventions to address the issues
  1. Enhance the **level of awareness** on gender at all levels for service provider and Community
  2. Strengthen gender **mainstreaming actions**
     - Support and promote gender-sensitive actions:
     - Capacity building for extension staff on gender mainstreaming
     - Assign focal person at all levels
  3. Enhance the **participation** of women and youth in agricultural extension

Key findings ...contd

4. Establish and strengthen linkages, network within, and other sectors

Establish synergy between Agricultural and Health Extension for gender-focused and improved advisory services

Enhance-Women Economic Empowerment

Gender mainstreaming through sectoral linkage (examples)

Enhance-Social Empowerment

Agriculture + Health + nutrition education in Schools
Key findings…contd

5. Allocate adequate resources to gender and youth related activities
6. Enhance women’s socio-economic empowerment
7. Promoting nutrition sensitive extension service

SWOT analysis of the current extension system

Opportunity
Conducive policy and strategy for agriculture sector (ADLI) and high commitment of govt.
Emerging agro-processing industries for VC development and embedded extension services.
Existence and growth of farmer coops and unions to provide extension services,
Existence of ATVETs to train extension agents
Increased focus on value chain development and marketing,
Existence of special initiatives such as AGP, Livelihoods Program, and SLM

Strength
Decentralized and well-structured extension system,
The establishment of ATVET colleges to produce middle level skilled manpower,
Robust workforce of development agents (21 per 10,000 farmers, higher than any other country’s ratio),
Establishment of FTCs at kebele-level,
Increased number of agricultural universities for skilled manpower devt,
Codified national extension approach,
Strong social networks
Increased demands by farmers for improved technologies

Weakness
Limited consistency and quality of extension implementation,
Weak coordination and linkage among actors in research and extension system,
Limited logistics and facilities for frontline extension workers,
Short-term focused campaigns divert attention from overall and long-term extension system responsibilities,
Due focus on model farmers,
Poor functioning of FTCs to provide demand based extension services,
Low motivation leading to high turnover of extension staff, mainly DAs,
Limited use of communication media and use of ICTs.

Threats
High turnover of experienced professionals in agricultural extension,
Price fluctuations on international markets for agricultural products,
Climate change and recurrent drought.
Key findings1 …contd

- **Challenges of agriculture extension service provision through DAs and FTCs**
  - Limited public and private funding to provide quality training;
  - Low quality of training as some DAs lack practical skill and experience;
  - DAs high staff turnover, approx. 10-15% per annum;

- **Limited knowledge and skill of extension staff on**
  - improved communication and facilitation,
  - market and value chain development,
  - agricultural risk management in a holistic manner,
  - connecting technological solutions with basic diversification and financial tools;
Key findings ...contd

- Trainers work overload
- Shortage of training resources at FTCs due to limited budget;
- Weak linkage between stakeholders and lack of collaboration among ATVET colleges;
- Minimum involvement of the private sector

Key findings1...contd

- Unwillingness of some stakeholders to engage in training
- Occupational Standards for some fields do not consider the indigenous knowledge of farmers
Key Findings 2

Smallholder farmer access to agri-skills and extension services delivery

Key findings 2 ...contd

- **KFs2**: Smallholder farmer access to agri-skills and extension services delivery
- **Mapping Actors**
  - Major actors in Ethiopian agricultural advisory services – delivery
    - Ministry of Agriculture and Regional Agricultural Bureaus along with their subsidiary institutions
    - Regional and federal agricultural research institutions,
    - Private enterprises, agro-industries,
    - NGOs and farmers organizations primarily cooperatives are also other actors involved
Key findings2 ...contd

• **Actors** in involved in different agri-skills and extension service delivery system -Kofele, LimuBilbilo and Digalu Tijo woredas

1. Smallholder malt barley producers
2. Woreda Sector Office
   - Woreda agriculture and livestock office
   - woreda cooperative promotion office
   - woreda women and children affairs
3. ATVET/TVEFs
   - Bekoji TVET
   - Ardaita ATVET
4. Research Centre & HIs
   - Kulumsa agricultural research centre
   - Arsi University
Key findings 2 …contd

5. Seed Companies
   - Oromia Seed Enterprise (OSE)
   - Ethiopian Seed Enterprise (ESE)

6. Traders and collectors
   - Brokers/Middle men
   - Rural collectors
   - Small and large Traders

7. MFIs
   - Wasasa MFI - Regional and Branch Office Wasasa
   - Harbu MFI
   - Busa Gonofa MFI

7. NGOs & other development supporters:
   - CNFA, GIZ, ERSHA, ATA
   - SP C&C IPs - HUNDE and EUCORD

8. Farmer Cooperatives Union (FCUs):
   - Galema FCU
   - Raya Kejewa FCU

9. Malter
   - Asela malt barely factory
   - Soufflet

10. Brewers
    - Heineken
    - Meta Diageo
    - Habesha
    - BGI-GM
    - DASHEN
Key findings ...contd

**Access and outreach in agri-skills and extension services delivery - Approaches**
- Government-led approaches
  - provision and support -a government responsibility

---

**Key findings ...contd**

**Approaches used in Arsi and West Arsi zones**
- Farmers reached by development agents
  - DA cannot reach not more than 20% of the farmers -a cropping season –in some kebeles
  - Ideally DAs would like reach all farmers in their areas
- constrained by lack of necessary working facilities
Key findings ...contd

- Development agent-farmer ratio in three study woredas, Arsi and West Zones

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Woreda</th>
<th>Farming HHs</th>
<th>FTC</th>
<th>DAs</th>
<th>DA:HHs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Limu Bilbilo</td>
<td>22,365</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>367</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DigaluTijo</td>
<td>18,231</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>337</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kofele</td>
<td>27,795</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Computed from respective woreda annual report

Key findings2 ...contd

- Specific approaches used in agri-skills delivery system
  - Technical training approaches - adopted
    - TOT provision
    - cascading approaches - Region –to- Kebele
Key findings2 …contd

Technical agri-skills training delivery systems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region Level</th>
<th>Woreda SMSs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOT on Extension Packages</strong></td>
<td>Woreda SMSs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Woreda Level</th>
<th>Train DAs - Selected Packages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Woreda SMSs</strong></td>
<td>Train DAs - Selected Packages</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kebele Level-FTC</th>
<th>DAs provide training</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>DAs provide training</strong></td>
<td>Model Farmers – Selected packages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DAs + Model Farmers train</strong></td>
<td>Medium Farmers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DAs + Model Farmers train</strong></td>
<td>Poor farmers, Women under MHHs, Youth (male)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key findings2 …contd

- The trainings provided include
  - practical demonstration,
  - field day, and individual and group extension service approach.
- Some places also Farmers Field School Approach – FTC and/or farmers own field based
Key findings2 …contd

- Specific approaches used in agri-inputs delivery system
  - Agri-input packages
    - improved seed varieties,
    - fertilizer,
    - herbicide and pesticide, and
    - farm implements
  - Approaches used:
    - Cluster approach – share border and adjacent plots of lands - cultivate the same crop and use the similar packages
  - Package provision and input use Vs categories of farmers:
    - The amount of input use and recommended methods application vary among model farmers, medium, poor farmers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category of farmers</th>
<th>Inputs type &amp; quantity used</th>
<th>Average Yield/ha</th>
<th>Average yield loss in reference to Model Farmer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Seed (qt/ha)</td>
<td>Fertilizer (qt/ha)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model Farmer</td>
<td>1.5 qt/ha</td>
<td>2 qt/ha</td>
<td>75 qt/ha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium Farmer</td>
<td>1.75 qt/ha</td>
<td>1.5 qt/ha</td>
<td>47 qt/ha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor Farmer</td>
<td>2 qt/ha</td>
<td>1 qt/ha</td>
<td>25 qt/ha</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: computed Kofele woreda agriculture office 2010E.C annual report
**Key findings ...contd**

Category and number of farmers received technical skills training for Belg and Meher season crop production, 2010/11 E.C, Kofele woreda

![Bar chart showing the number of farmers in different categories received technical skills training](chart)

**Key findings2 ...contd**

- **FTC based extension service delivery**
  - The Ethiopian agricultural extension system is heavily dependent on Farmer Training Centers (FTCs) and trained DAs that give extension support to farmers.
  - With approximately 21 development agents (DAs) per 10,000 farmers,
  - Ethiopia has one of the densest agricultural extension systems in the world
Key findings2 ...contd

- At national level to-date over 83,000 DAs -trained and graduated
- About 56,000 DAs are working in agricultural extension.
- So far about 12,500 FTCs -established and
- Regional governments - aggressively moving forward to establish the remaining FTCs –
  - the national target of 18,000 FTCs

Key findings2 ...contd

- The GoE has invested substantially in
  - the infrastructure and resources to create a strong agricultural field extension presence, and it is committed to further expanding
- The FTC should include
  - an office/classroom building,
  - housing for the DA staff,
  - livestock buildings,
  - wells,
  - fencing,
  - demonstration farms (DFs), and
  - other needed facilities.
Key findings2 ...contd

- The kebele will typically allocate
- 1.0 to 2.5 hectares of community land to the FTC,
- land that can be used to demonstrate and train farmers on-
- new technologies, farming systems, crops, livestock, or other enterprises.

### FTC classification: minimum criteria by functionality levels

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Basic</th>
<th>Intermediate</th>
<th>Advanced</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>At least 3 DAs,</td>
<td>Active community management structure,</td>
<td>Revenue generation for self-sustainability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately furnished FTC</td>
<td>Adequate level of facilities, /equipment in place for FTC training and demonstrations,</td>
<td>Active linkage with cooperatives, (MFIs),</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>building,</td>
<td>Trainings and demonstrations,</td>
<td>research centers and ATVETs and farmers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agro-ecology based FTCs and</td>
<td>Trainings and demonstrations at least</td>
<td>innovations groups,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demonstration plot,</td>
<td>in three thematic areas,</td>
<td>Availability of operational resource centers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTC training and demonstration plan,</td>
<td>FTC trainings efficiently linked to</td>
<td>(connectivity, information),</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTC management committee and</td>
<td>demonstrations,</td>
<td>Ability to handle level 1 &amp; 2 training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTC operational guideline</td>
<td>FTC training materials, manuals and guidelines available.</td>
<td>Provision of full-fledged extension services to farmers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: MoARN, Agricultural Extension Strategy of Ethiopia, 2017
Key findings ...contd

- FTCs requirements for effective teaching-learning process
  1. Organizational capabilities and communication within the service
  2. Leadership capabilities, commitment and participation of target population
  3. Quality and quantity of extension agents/trainers
  4. Selecting appropriate teaching materials and training methods
  5. Incentives and motivation to extension agents
  6. Adequate training for extension staff
  7. Amount of work to extension agent
  8. Financial resources and a model for revenue generation that contributes to financial sustainability
  9. National agricultural policies
  10. Monitoring and evaluation

Key findings ...contd

Constraints to inclusiveness in agri-skills and extension service delivery

1. DA and number of HHs to be addressed
   - Allocation of DAs only considers kebele but HHs/kebele.
   - DA can address not more than 20% of the HHs in cropping season
   - Government policy proposed 250-300 HHs/DA to reach
   - Observed a DA is supposed to reach more - in some case 1000 HHs to be addressed by 2 DAs only
Key findings ...contd

2. Training and input supply focuses on lead farmers and road side sites
3. Attitude-little attention & no specific package
4. Limited knowledge and skill of DAs
   • Technical skills and soft skills
   • Farmers need both –technical and soft skills
   • DAs’ capacity and education levels- and Youth education levels

5. Specialized DA serve as multi-purpose DA
   • Current curriculum of ATVETs DAs - trained as specialist rather than as generalist
   • Actual service –generalist
6. Gaps between technical training provided and agri-inputs demand by farmers
Key findings ...contd

7. **Top down and limited training to farmers**
   - In training to farmers in FTCs is mainly focused on crops with major emphasis on
     - theoretical concepts and very limited practical aspects

8. **Inadequate facilities to motivate and retain DAs**

9. **Unattractive career path for DAs**

---

Key findings ...contd

10. **Inadequate housing - old and new design of DA house:**
    - all FTCs should have **adequate housing** available for their DA staff,
    - The **new DAs housing** should be for **three DAs** and include simple furniture (such as a bed, table, and chairs) for each unit.
    - But in **study woredas** majority of the DAs housing were the **old design** which can serve for one DA only.
    - More than **50% of their working hours** lost on **travel**
Key findings ...contd

11. Conflict of interest
12. FTCs facilities poorly equipped and managed
13. Campaign mode of activities implementation
Key findings 2...contd

- **Areas of Malt Barley value chain technical skills needs of DAs**
  - The first thematic area - malt barley production
  - The second thematic area - agribusiness management
  - The third thematic area - market and marketing analysis
  - The fourth thematic area - the provision of support services for value chain improvement

Key findings 2...contd

- **Proposed levels for providing training**
  - Pre-service training on VC
    - To address the needs of the farmers effectively and efficiently-VC
KEY FINDINGS 3:
THE PUBLIC SYSTEM: ATVETS AND TVETS

1. Mapping –A-TVETs in the study areas
2. Profile A-TVETs
3. Mapping curriculum and courses offered at ATVETs
4. Quality and relevance of learning
5. Teaching and learning methods at ATVETs/TVETs
6. Provision of relevant agri-skills training at ATVETs/TVETs
7. Agri-technical and soft skills integrated curriculum development
KEY FINDINGS 3: A-TVETs - public system

8. Agri-technical and soft skills integrated curriculum development
9. Addressing farming system of ATVETs/TVETs their mandate areas
10. ATVETs linkage with FTCs and Extension System
11. Curriculum contents - malt barley and potato VCs, climate change
12. SWOT-ATVETs/TVETs
13. Conceptual framework for selected policy areas

KEY FINDINGS 3: A-TVETs - public system

- Concept – ATVET and TVET
- TVET-
  - is defined as “a comprehensive term referring to those aspects of the educational process involving, in addition to general education, the study of technologies and related sciences, and the acquisition of practical skills, attitudes, understanding and knowledge relating to occupations in various sectors of economic and social life” (UNESCO 2004: 7)
  - Administered – MoE, Federal and Regional TVET Agency/Bureau / commission
- ATVET-
  - Agricultural technical and vocational education and training (ATVET), as a subset of TVET approaches and institutions –
  - Administered: MOA
KEY FINDINGS 3: A-TVETs - public system

- Mapping – A – TVET
  - In Arsi and West Arsi zones there is two colleges
    - Ardiata ATVET
    - Bekoji TVET

- No private owned college which provides agri-skills training
- Is that possible to establish private ATVET agri-skills provider?
- Ardaita ATVET accountable to MoA
- Bekoji TVET accountable for Oromia Regional TVET Agency/commission
KEY FINDINGS 3: A-TVETs - public system

- Mapping curriculum and courses offered at ATVETs
- Ardaita ATVET
  - The curriculum –
    - National TVET-OS
    - Courses - 1 to Level 5,
  - Cooperative courses

---

### Ardaita ATVET

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Course</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Level IV</td>
<td>Cooperative Marketing Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cooperative Accounting &amp; Auditing Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level III</td>
<td>Cooperative Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cooperative Accounting &amp; Auditing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level II</td>
<td>Cooperative Promotion and Marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level I</td>
<td>Basic Cooperatives Work</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
KEY FINDINGS 3: A-TVETs - public system

Quality and relevance of learning at Ardiata

- Enrolment and graduate
- Currently the college provide training

![Enrolment by region and sex (2017/18), Ardaita ATVET](chart.png)
KEY FINDINGS 3: A-TVETs - public system

Figure 6: Female and male graduates at Ardaita ATVET College, 2013-2017

Teaching and learning methods at ATVETs/TVETs

- **30:70 teaching model and challenges**
  - Framework 70% practical and 30% theoretical,
- **The new TVET strategy – Outcome-based approach**
KEY FINDINGS 3: A-TVETs -public system

• **Outcome-Based Approach**
  • The goal of the National TVET system - as formulated in its vision and objectives –
    • is to create a competent and adaptable workforce (both male and female)
    • to be the backbone of economic and social development and
    • to enable an increasing number of citizens to find gainful and self-employment in the different economic sectors of the country.

KEY FINDINGS 3: A-TVETs -public system

• **Outcome-Based Approach**
  • The national TVET system has re-organized into an outcome-based system
  • identified competences needed in the labour market will become the final benchmark of
    • teaching, training and learning, and that all institutions, rules and regulations of the TVET system will be (re-)defined so that they support citizens to become competent
KEY FINDINGS 3: A-TVETs - public system

1. Cooperative training/Apprenticeship - very challenged
2. Performance tracking – little/not yet
3. Agri-technical and soft skills integrated curriculum development
   • technical skills in agriculture is not featured among the courses offered
   • cooperative promotion with some soft skills like entrepreneurship, marketing, business and leadership

4. Quality assurance
   • Two types of assessments
     • annual evaluation for all staff members
     • COC for instructors and trainees
KEY FINDINGS 3: A-TVETs - public system

- Agri-technical and soft skills integrated curriculum development
  - Limited efforts
  - Need further analysis by the colleges
    - degree of integration,
    - extent of alignment,
    - contents and scope of
  - some soft skills courses are offered in relation to agricultural technical skills and the extension system labor market need

- Addressing the farming system of ATVETs/TVETs mandate areas
- Little attention to producing ‘agri-entrepreneur’ graduates - broader range of marketable skills, both on and off farm
- Curriculum on potato value chains skills and Climate change
  - General but no specific courses
- ATVETs linkages with FTCs and agri-extension
  - Little or no linkage
KEY FINDINGS 3: A-TVETs -public system

- SWOT –ATVET/TVETS

Key findings 4: private sector actors and CSO'S in agri-skills and extension services provision

- Study zones-Arsi & W.Arsi
  1. Farm Service Centers (FSCs)
  2. Private Input providers
    - Farm Service Centers (FSCs)
    - private input providers
  3. MFIs roles in agri-skills and extension service delivery – Relatively
    - Direct input supply
    - Collaborate-for-agri-skills
    - Not any study -farmers readiness for payment-for Technical & Soft skills training
Key findings4: private sector actors...

- FSCs are identified as high potential private business model
  - in agri-skills and private extension service provision
  - model was introduced by CNFA a one stop-shop farming solution, in Ethiopia’s Oromia region in 2012
- Currently, the GIZ-Green Innovation- establishment of five FSCs to serve 25,000 farmers

Key findings4: private sector actors...

- Three FSCs –visited
  - Iteya FSC,
  - Sagure FSC &
  - Asela FSC
- Bekoji, Shirka, Saguare FSCs under Galema FCU (USAID-FtF supported through ATA )
Key findings 4: private sector actors

- Why FSCs are Potential for private agri-skills and extension service?
  - Technical advice
  - Provision training
  - Organize of awareness creation
  - Introduction and Promotion of new agri-inputs and company profile
    - using local FM radio,
    - market day using montarbo
    - different meetings and events
Key findings 4: private sector actors...

- Some of FSCs agri-skills and extension services include:
  - agri inputs supply: seed, insecticides, herbicides, fungicides, farm implements
  - animal feed
  - veterinary drug service
  - protective devices
  - agri-skill training on agrochemical equipment likes sprayers
  - agricultural extension services and advise

Key findings 4: private sector actors.....contd

4. Private agro-processors as extension service providers –Examples
   - Heineken
   - AMF-now under Oromia Cooperative Federation
   - Meta Diago
   - BGI-GM

5. Farmers Cooperative Union (FCU)
   - Galema FCU
   - Raya Kajewa FCU
Conclusions

- **Access and outreach – agri-skills & extension service** -
  - very limited
  - Challenged with multitude of factors to reach the vulnerable groups
- **Quality and relevance of DAs training** –
  - agro-ecology little attention
  - limited integration of gender and climate change
  - Lack systematic integration of agri-technical skills & Soft skills
- **Private sector**
  - involvement is very limited and
  - no legal frameworks

Dialogue and policy recommendations

- **Access and outreach in agri-skills and extension service delivery**

1. **Design extension and advisory services focusing on best-fit approaches**:
   - Shift: best practice to best-fit approaches
   - incorporated in the extension policy and strategy by the policy making body, the GoE and the MoAL
2. **Expanding the capacity of DAs and Woreda experts in agri-technical and soft skills**
   - DAs' capacity inadequate and not well equipped with such interdisciplinary knowledge.
   - need capacity development of extension personnel at different levels:
     - at farmer level, DA level, SMS level, and TVET colleges/institutions level
   - led primarily by the MOAL, OBAL, woreda and kebele level government line offices and collaboration with Federal and Oromia regional TVETs, and donors.
Dialogue recommendation ...

- Develop a dynamic geo-spatial profile and statistics of women, youth and people with disabilities
  - to design best-fit approach
  - systematically developed socio-economics profiles which is integrated with geo-spatial of the disadvantaged farmers groups in a given woreda and kebele
  - very critical for intervention design
- Improving of DAs handling system

Dialogue and policy recommendations

- FTC resources and community ownership development
- Improving linkage and coordination between public and private sectors
  - *Strengthening Agriculture Development Partners Linkage Advisory Councils (ADPLACs)*-woreda
- Support ICT to enhance access and outreach in agri-skills and extension service delivery
Dialogue ...contd

- Expand significantly training provision for women, youth and people with disabilities areas- this should be achieved through

Dialogue ...contd

- **Quality and learning related policy and dialogue issues**
  - Legal framework vs local context curriculum
  - Technical and Soft skills integration
  - Labor market assessment
  - Performance tracking /follow-ups studies
  - Improve ATVETs linkage with FTCs and agricultural extension service providers
Dialogue...contd

- Private sectors assisted agri-skills and extension service delivery
  - Develop a clear frameworks and guidelines for private sectors and CSOs for extension services delivery
  - Develop incentives mechanisms
- Private sector-driven agricultural value chain support: Innovative approaches in funding extension services
  - outsourcing financing, and embedded advisory services, contractual farming

Galatooma!